Parking Privatization Transparency and Accountability Report

A Resolution Proposed to University Senate (1/31/13)

Be it therefore resolved that the University Senate expects an annual Parking Privatization Transparency and Accountability Report to be presented by the University administration to the appropriate University Senate committee each year, starting in FY 2013 and throughout the term of the parking privatization agreement. Each report is expected to include information from the previous fiscal year as well as historical year-by-year data broken out as suggested below (with historical information beginning no later than FY 2010):

1. An accounting of OSU financial details related to parking privatization including:
   - the disposition and status of the up-front payment principal;
     All of the upfront payment from the parking privatization of $483 million was invested in the University Long Term Investment Pool. Earnings and distributions are shown below.
   - returns earned on the up-front payment;
     The returns for the university long term investment portfolio, net of fees, as of June 30, 2016 are:

   FY 2016: -3.4%; FY 2015: +3.8%; FY 2014: +14.4%; 3 Years: +4.7%
   - distributions from the up-front payment and the purposes for which they were used;
     See Table below and expenditures under the next bullet.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Long-Term Investment Pool</th>
<th>FY13 Distribution</th>
<th>FY14 Distribution</th>
<th>FY15 Distribution</th>
<th>FY16 Distribution</th>
<th>FY17 Distribution</th>
<th>4.3/4-Yr Distribution Total</th>
<th>Actual Market Value FY16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty &amp; Research</td>
<td>$7.2M</td>
<td>$9.4M</td>
<td>$9.1M</td>
<td>$8.8M</td>
<td>$9.3M</td>
<td>$43.8M</td>
<td>$210.7M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Scholarships</td>
<td>$3.0M</td>
<td>$3.9M</td>
<td>$3.8M</td>
<td>$3.7M</td>
<td>$3.9M</td>
<td>$18.2M</td>
<td>$87.5M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts District Development</td>
<td>$1.8M</td>
<td>$2.3M</td>
<td>$2.3M</td>
<td>$2.2M</td>
<td>$2.3M</td>
<td>$11.0M</td>
<td>$52.7M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation &amp; Sustainability</td>
<td>$5.4M</td>
<td>$7.1M</td>
<td>$6.8M</td>
<td>$6.6M</td>
<td>$7.0M</td>
<td>$32.9M</td>
<td>$158M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>$17.4M</td>
<td>$22.7M</td>
<td>$22.0M</td>
<td>$21.3M</td>
<td>$22.5M</td>
<td>$105.9M</td>
<td>$509M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Proceeds received Sept. 2012 therefore the FY13 distribution represents just 9 months of the year.
recent expenditure histories for comparable purposes from all sources;

Expenditures for Faculty & Research: These funds are used exclusively for hiring Discovery Themes faculty. The university has hired 82 faculty members and has authorized an additional 82 searches, many of which are under way. The $43.8 million in distributions from the parking endowment is used to support salary and benefits and start-up costs for these faculty. Parking funds support half of the total costs of these hires.

Expenditures for student scholarships:

These funds provide financial aid for 406 students in the past year:
- 102 Eminence Fellowship scholars (full cost of attendance undergraduate scholarships)
- 182 Research Scholar Awards ($1,000 each)
- 95 Undergraduate Summer Research Fellows ($3,500 each)
- 27 stipends for Presidential Fellows ($27,312 stipends to graduate students)

Expenditures for the Arts District include: These funds have provided $6.4M toward the renovation of Sullivant Hall, and funding is accumulating for further Arts District projects.

Expenditures for Transportation and Sustainability include:

Total Sources ($17.1M):
- Endowment funding for CABS $6.6M
- Charter and Vehicle Repair revenue $4.4M
- Medical Center Transportation and voucher transfer $5.1M
- Medical Center Valet transfer $5M
- Sublet of CABS buses and equipment rental $.5M

Total Expenses ($20.2M):
- General Funds $13.0M
- Earnings $6.3M
- Shared Services $.8M
- Debt Payments $.1M

In the two years prior to the concession Transportation and Parking (T&P) lost $2.3 M and $2.5M respectively.

- sources of funds for, and expenses related to, services for which FY 2012 parking revenues are currently paying (e.g. Campus Area Bus Service, parking facilities debt service, etc.;) and
- Parking facilities debt service was defeased using the debt service reserve. Campus Area Bus Service (part of Transportation and Traffic Management) will receive $6.6 million FY16 in funding from the transportation operations and sustainability endowment fund.

- other expenses related to the parking privatization agreement (e.g., for third-party consultants, compliance monitoring, legal services, etc., whether those expenses are paid through a residual OSU Transportation and Parking office or through other units/services/offices).

$23,955 expenses were reported within Transportation and Traffic Management for concession management in FY 2016. We are not aware of any other such expenses since the concession was closed.
2. A report of the results of the annual OSU parking customer satisfaction survey conducted as part of compliance monitoring, including:

- Customer satisfaction trends recognized by the University;
  - CampusParc provides quarterly customer satisfaction data. The metrics reported include call volume, average call response time, enforcement metrics and equipment reliability. This information is reported to the Parking Advisory Committee. Highlights included:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average calls per month</td>
<td>6257</td>
<td>7844</td>
<td>6167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly abandoned calls - number</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>1111</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly abandoned calls - %</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>5.66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Hold Time per call</td>
<td>1:12</td>
<td>2:12</td>
<td>1:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average citations per month</td>
<td>4779</td>
<td>5572</td>
<td>3926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Monthly Citation Charges</td>
<td>$219,395</td>
<td>$266,936</td>
<td>$189,115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Citation Amount</td>
<td>$45.49</td>
<td>$47.86</td>
<td>$48.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Permits are predominately purchased on web and users have acclimated to system.
- Abandoned calls have decreased both in number and in percentage of calls due to shorter call times.
- Two phone lines added to call center; wait hold time on hold during fall rush dropped from 5:36 minutes Q3 2015 to average 1:24 minutes Q3 2016.
- Response time within 24-hours to emails consistently remains over 99.5%.
- Garage equipment uptime + 99.5% last 3 years.
- A customer satisfaction survey was completed by CampusParc in Fall of 2015 and reported to PAC August 2016.

- Quality or service concerns reported by the University to the private parking operator; and
  - As mentioned in last year’s report, one of the more common concerns reported to both CampusParc and the university is the availability of parking spaces for faculty and staff, particularly in the Wexner Medical Center and more recently in the Lane Avenue Parking Garage.
  - Related to the perceived lack of available spaces is the recurring complaint that the parking permit system that does not meet customer expectations. Those that purchase a certain type of permit are frustrated when spaces are not available
  - Customers have expressed frustrations when their normal parking routines are disrupted due to campus events or other competing uses of the parking system. CampusParc and the university strive to provide ample notice to the campus community of any potential parking impacts.
any actions taken or not taken by the private operator to address previously reported concerns.

- The Wexner Medical Center PAC is investigating options for the availability of parking spaces for faculty and staff. In addition, a subcommittee of PAC is looking into Lane Ave. garage utilization and options.
- CampusParc has completed upgrading the lighting in 34 surface lots across campus.
- In order to more successfully communicate planned parking disruptions ahead of time, CampusParc made a targeted effort to increase e-mails warning of parking disruptions and placed more temporary alert signs in parking lots, along with utilizing their website and social media more effectively.
- CampusParc addressed elevator equipment in Cannon N+S, Union N+S, Ninth West and Gateway garages. In addition, two surface lots were restored; 19 lots received preventative seal coating; and 8 garages received repairs for a total of almost $2M.
- Improved cleanliness with higher satisfaction levels (64% rated 4 or 5).
- Investigated and procured $5.5M in new parking access control equipment to replace obsolete models currently in garages (infrastructure work and testing in progress; installation to occur Summer 2017).

3. An accounting of the total parking revenues collected by OSU and/or the private operator, with a breakdown of revenues by parking permit types and other methods used to generate revenues from parking, as well as any public financial or legal disclosures made by the private operator or concessionaire pertaining to its role in the agreement.

Due to trade secrets assertions and related law, the response to this question is limited to the following:

- The university is due $204,355.92 from CampusParc for the net operating revenue generated by CampusParc’s enforcement program during the 2015-2016 Permit Year.
- In September 2016, there were 37,762 active annual permits in the parking system compared to 37,229 active permits in September 2015, an increase of 1.4%.

4. A report of all mediation, arbitration, or litigation involving the University and any other party with respect to campus parking.

There have been no arbitration or litigation actions involving the University and any other party with respect to campus parking.