

Year-End Report
Senate Diversity Committee 2018-2019
Submitted by: Prof. Patricia Enciso, Chair

Committee Members

Pat Enciso, Chair

Wendy Smooth, Past Chair

Rachel Bowen Faculty Council

Jesus Lara Faculty Council

Andrej Rotter Faculty Council

Deanna Wilkinson Faculty Council

Eugenai Costa-Giomi Faculty Council

Abdoul Sam Faculty Council

Russell Hassan Presidential

Derek West Staff – USAC

Megan Sayres Staff – USAC

Kathy Lechman Staff - Presidential

Lei Guo Undergraduate Student Government

Fareedah Haroun Inter-Professional Council

Jasmine Richardson Council of Graduate Students

James Moore III Provost/Designee

Linette Hillis AVP OHR / Designee

Introduction

The University Senate Diversity Committee is charged to “...study issues that relate to the implementation of the university nondiscriminatory policy. It shall recommend policies that foster an environment of civility, tolerance, and mutual respect.” We aim to build partnerships that foreground the interests of diversity, equity, and inclusion across all domains of university life. In doing so, the committee convenes OSU leaders to learn about new initiatives, to raises critical questions, and discern relationships among units that might strengthen our efforts to fulfill our mission.

Overview

In 2018-2019 we met seven times, with ten to thirteen members in attendance, representing elected and appointed faculty, staff, undergraduate and graduate students. I thank all committee members who were diligent in their attendance and service throughout the year.

We began the year with a review of the 2017-2018 year-end report and then outlined concerns we would address in 2018-2019. Our primary concern was the ongoing and urgent need to recruit and retain faculty and staff who are underrepresented in all demographic categories, including women, indigenous, and people of color. The experiences and insights of underrepresented faculty and staff prompt new questions, scholarship, and practices. Greater diversity among faculty, staff, and students expands our understanding of the questions facing the people of the state, nation, and world. In addition, by working closely with a more diverse faculty and staff, a wider population of faculty, staff, and students may become knowledgeable and invested in the labor of identifying concerns, mobilizing initiatives, and creating spaces that support equity and diversity across OSU campuses.

While faculty and staff strive to proactively address structural inequities in many ways, major initiatives related to diversity and equity require the leadership and infrastructure directed through administrative offices. Thus, the 2018-2019 Senate Diversity Committee agenda focused on the intersection of (1) new administrative policies and practices, (2) new developments in graduate and undergraduate recruiting and retention across campuses, (3) EHE's new PhD postdoctoral recruitment program, (4) regional campus life changes and transitions to Columbus campus, and (4) the everyday realities and unequal compensation hindering the retention and recognition of women at Ohio State University.

In addition, committee members Derek West, Kathy Lechman, and Russell Hassan worked in collaboration with Michelle Bondurant of OHR, to review applications for the university wide Distinguished Diversity Enhancement Award and honor five recipients in April 2019.

<https://hr.osu.edu/news/2019/04/22/distinguished-diversity-enhancement-award-recipients-recognized-for-their-exceptional-contributions/>

Dialogue

Across the year, we listened to colleagues whose perspectives and programming are currently shaping the meaning and practice of diversity, equity, and inclusion at Ohio State University. In relation to our inquiries and dialogues, we have benefitted enormously from Vice Provost James Moore III's continued engagement with our committee and his updates from the Office of Diversity and Inclusion.

- September 2018 Anna Babel, Associate Professor, Director, Buckidream (DACA students)
- October 2018 Vice Provost for Graduate Studies, Alicia Bertone and Director of Programming, Carolina Morales
- November 2018 Assistant Vice Provost for Student Academic Success, David Graham
- January 2019 Associate Vice President for Talent, Diversity, and Leadership, Lin Hillis
- February 2019 Dean Pope-Davis, College of Education and Human Ecology
- March 2019 We hosted a Joint Hearing on Gender equity, compensation and benefits for women faculty and staff, with members of the Senate Diversity Committee, the Senate Faculty Compensation

and Benefits Committee, the President and Provost's Committee on the Status of Women, and USAC. Prof. Stephanie Seveau and Prof. Dana Renga, steered the FCBC subcommittee on gender equity and compensation, Prof. Theresa Delgadillo Chaired PPCW.

- April 2019 Dean Greg Rose (Marion) and Dean Norman Jones (Mansfield)
- April 2019 University Registrar and Executive Director of Enrollment Services, Jack Miner
- April 2019 Celebration of Diversity Enhancement Award honorees

Documents

The following documents guided our dialogue with university leaders about policies and actions already undertaken, or in process, aimed at attaining new, ambitious goals that open the university to greater supports for and engagement with diverse faculty, staff, and students.

- 2018 Undergraduate Enrollment Report <http://enrollmentservices.osu.edu/report.pdf>
- First Year Trends Au 2009-2018
[http://oesar.osu.edu/pdf/student_enrollment/trends/5 Year Trend by Campus Level and Residency.pdf](http://oesar.osu.edu/pdf/student_enrollment/trends/5_Year_Trend_by_Campus_Level_and_Residency.pdf)
- Campus Conversation on Graduate Education report <https://oaa.osu.edu/report-campus-conversation-graduate-education>
- Campus change statistics <https://odi.osu.edu/for-students/undergraduate/campus-change.html>
- Five-year enrollment report –regional campuses http://oesar.osu.edu/student_enrollment.aspx
- College of Education and Human Ecology – Postdoctoral Recruitment Initiative
<https://ehe.osu.edu/postdoctoral-fellows/>
- Ohio State Human Resources 2018-2023 Strategic Plan <https://hr.osu.edu/transformation/>
 - o FCBC Powerpoint document (available on request)
 - o Women's Place 2018-2019 Annual Report
 - o PCCW Annual Report

Understanding and Creating Systemic Change

The Senate Diversity committee members recognize several sites of strategic, systemic change happening across campus with unprecedented energy, focus, and dedicated resources. As outlined below, we also urge action and dialogue related to student mental health and advising support, cross-campus equity and inclusion initiatives, and the gender equity gap in salary, recognition, and climate.

Graduate School: Recruitment and Programming

Graduate School changes, led by Vice Provost Bertone, are informed by the Campus Conversation on Graduate Education report. <https://oaa.osu.edu/report-campus-conversation-graduate-education>. Initiatives include increasing the diversity of graduate student enrollment and graduation to match the demographics of the United States. This means for example, shifting the current enrollment of Latinx students from about 4% to 25% of the campus student population. The Graduate School has also initiated

- o A review of fellowship application policies and procedures.
- o Proactive outreach to undergraduates who could matriculate to a graduate program.
- o New recruitment initiatives among OSU and non-OSU undergraduates.

Undergraduate Education: Identifying and Supporting Students in the 'Murky Middle'

Continuing our 2017-2018 discussions with **undergraduate education** leadership, David Graham, Director of the Student Academic Success program led us through an overview of the multiple strands of review and coordination taking place on behalf of undergraduates, particularly those who are in the 'murky middle'. Many of these students are 'campus change' or transfer students.

- Approximately 1/3 of all Ohio State students who graduate each year started off as Transfer or Campus Change students.
- Nearly 1/3 of all Ohio State freshmen start their academic careers at one of the five regional campuses.
- *Students who are doing well tend to be in professional programs – and have clear pathways and goals to meet.*
- "Murky middle"
 - o In the 80th percentile, often not struggling due to adequate academic success : GPA 2.3-3.2; yet dissatisfied and unfocused
 - o Less likely to graduate
 - o Disproportionate number of underrepresented students
 - o Students who do not have the social capital to progress academically

The committee raised questions about the mechanisms by which students are identified and notified if they are facing an academic crossroads –i.e., failing or not progressing, with low grades. We expressed concern that systems of identification may trigger a deeper retreat especially among historically underrepresented students and students of color.

We recognize that identifying student needs – even before they know they have such a need – may be critical for their re-engagement with guidance and advising services. We want to ensure, however, that 'guidance first' versus 'warning first' language is used to support students.

DACA: Intersecting Concerns with Advising, Mental Health, Fiscal Stability

Dr. Anna Babel described the supports and concerns experienced by students who self-identify as 'deferred action for childhood arrivals' (DACA). Many students are in holding patterns, concerned about their parents' and other family members' status, and searching for ways to sustain their academic programs.

- o Many students hear different advice and are redirected to different resources and programs – with little agreement or communication among them. Students, then, are left to figure out whether or not a particular decision or action will or will not jeopardize their continuation with funding.
- o Students need mental health support, academic guidance, and basic funding guidance.
- o A designated advisor, versus an advisor who has many roles, would help them navigate the complexities of OSU's services.
- o Costs for DACA renewal are high with uncertain outcomes: \$500.00 (plus legal fees) for a 2 year renewal

The committee noted that the guidance sought by DACA students – and the confusion that ensues—is experienced by undergraduates across the university.

HR Strategic Plan: Faculty Recruitment and Retention

Lin Hillis and Mollie Driscoll reviewed the recent HR Transformation Strategic Plan related, especially to faculty and demographic changes in employment and skills development. The committee is especially aware of the continuing question: How are OSU leaders reviewing and improving hiring and retention strategies? We recognize the relationship between student success and the presence (and thriving) of more diverse faculty and staff.

The report states: “According to the US Department of Labor, US employers will need 30 million new college-educated workers by 2020. New entrants to the workforce are smaller in number than baby boomers and many lack skills employers need. By 2020, 70-75% of the workforce will be millennials. Facilitating conversation and ideations on the topic of diversity to move from learning and understanding to implementation of key strategies is the next step in advancing progress. People of color make up nearly 33% of the workforce today. By 2045, there will be no racial majority in the U.S. workplace. Talent management, including attracting, recruiting, onboarding and retaining top talent to contribute their best work, is an ongoing HR challenge for employers globally as all compete to secure expertise and experience...”

The committee raised a number of questions related to the value of using standardized diversity statements, overall standardization of hiring policies and the use of minority reporting and oversight, much of which has faltered and is unevenly practiced across campus.

We also commend the work of HR and their outreach with stakeholders who have reviewed and revised – and now implemented the Sexual Misconduct Modules. The uptake for these modules has been impressive with over 10,000 views among faculty, staff, and students. – a different levels of required enrollment.

The committee recognizes that all of these units are working closely with the Office of Diversity and Inclusion. In turn, ODI is able to advise the Senate Diversity Committee on the need for vigilance and engagement with diversity practices and programs on all campuses.

We also applaud the accomplishments and donor designations to ODI in support of student services and scholarships. Dr. Moore’s work is changing the life trajectories of students and their families.

Faculty Talent, Diversity, and a New Recruiting Initiative: Postdoctoral Fellows in EHE

Dean Pope-Davis outlined the key questions driving initiatives underway in the College of Education and Human Ecology that offer transformative potential for diverse faculty to thrive in the College and university. Notable among the initiatives is the postdoctoral fellowship program, that brought in more than 30 candidates from across the country who made powerfully evident that a climate of enthusiasm for academic talent and diversity will be key to changing the future of hiring and retention.

Regional Campus and Columbus Campus: Listening and Growing Together

Deans Greg Rose and Norman Jones described the initiatives underway at Marion and Mansfield campuses to accommodate the educational choices and needs that inspire students to live on campus and graduate from regional campuses, as well as those students who change campuses or transfer to other Ohio higher education programs. They noted that students who do not graduate from regional campuses may actually graduate from other area colleges.

Committee members listened intently to the descriptions of change and need on regional campuses. Students' success depends on a sense of belonging, a sense of purpose, and a sense of fiscal stability. These needs are being addressed in multiple ways by regional deans and faculty.

Committee members explored how Columbus faculty and administrators can be more proactive and responsive to students who seek campus change. Among the recommendations, Dean Jones highlighted the value of building relationships with faculty and students across campuses, through clubs, programs, and purposeful visits.

Student Identity and Official Categories for Identity Designation

In response to a request from the Graduate Student Association, regarding the designation of Middle Eastern North African (MENA) identity on OSU student documents, committee members welcomed Jack Miner, University Registrar and Executive Director of Enrollment Services, to discuss the use of MENA on application and registration forms and how this and other designations might be revised to better reflect the experiences and identities held by OSU students, faculty, and staff.

Miner provided a clear history and overview of the different regulations guiding identity designations; and assured committee members that the Registrar's office has worked diligently to create the most inclusive designation process within available guidelines. Currently, students must follow federal guidelines which offer only a Black/White designation for MENA students. This designation can be changed by students through the Buckeyelink portal.

Gender Equity, Compensation, and Climate

A full report on the Joint Hearing on gender equity, compensation and benefits for women faculty and staff, is not possible in this document. Minutes from the meeting summarize the findings across key documents and outline the questions and actions to be pursued in 2019-2020. Based on reported findings, attendees recognized clear patterns of gender inequity in compensation and benefits at Ohio State. Reports also substantiated concerns expressed by women faculty and staff, that Ohio State does not yet provide a climate for thriving in one's chosen career. Indeed, women faculty and staff, especially women in underrepresented categories, experience a higher than expected rate of lower compensation, lower recognition, and lower satisfaction given the higher numbers of women who are employed at OSU.

- On average, female faculty members' salaries are between 3% and 9% lower than their male peers.
- The gender salary gap is not resolving and appears to increase over time.
- Subcommittee members met with Deans between 11/2018 and 3/2019 to ask: How do colleges analyze the genders salary gap? What action plans exist to reduce the gap?
- No college mentioned receiving guidelines from OAA on how to address the gender salary inequity. It also appears that this topic is not sufficiently discussed at Dean's meetings with the President and Provost.

- The Annual Merit Compensation Process (AMCP): 2% increase/year over the 10 past years. This is not sufficient to address the existing inequities in salary.
 - The gender equity gap is too complicated to solve through traditional funding mechanisms of AMCP, likely because it does not include enough funding. Additional initiatives need to be considered.
-
- The PPCW note that satisfaction with compensation has declined since 2008.
 - In addition, the Women's Place culture survey reveals women faculty members' low satisfaction with responsiveness to concerns, equal treatment related to rewards and compensation, and the stress of the work environment.
 - Similarly, women staff members experience a lower sense of fairness and clarity about pathways for promotion; less support and openness at work; and low optimism regarding social health and trust.

The joint hearing inspired a focused, deep discussion about the practices that produce inequity for women at OSU. We recommend that joint meetings such as this one be formed annually among senate committees. In response to many expressions of concern that initiatives and questions receive adequate follow up, the Senate Diversity Committee will institute the PPCW practice of 'looping' (documenting) proposed changes over time so we will be able to document initiatives, reports, and dialogues for follow up discussion and action. The Chair and Past Chair will work together to identify initiatives, questions, and concerns to be included in a designated 'follow up' section of each annual report.

In Conclusion

We see fundamental shifts in the way OSU is addressing and reaching for greater accessibility for and engagement with and among diverse students, faculty and staff. Along with these positive shifts, however, the committee notes continuing concerns and questions identified in the 2017-2018 report, related to systemic accountability for equity and diversity.

Leadership

- Given the extent of changes underway, how are units and leadership using available data – and extending our data collection – to document and track meaningful change.
- For example, how can OSU leadership more actively respond to students' need for immediate and ongoing mental health care, advising direction, and sense of belonging.
- How can OSU leadership address the gender salary equity gap and gender-based climate concerns?
- How can OSU leadership create vital, transformative practices to increase and positively engage the talent of diverse faculty, staff, and students.
- How do leadership changes reflect OSU's commitment to diversity and inclusion?
- Finally, leadership changes mean restarting old conversations rather than growing into new conversations. How can we better track and use our growth across dialogues as leadership changes occur?

Recruitment and Retention

- Engage College Diversity Officers regarding best practices around building robust diversity practices in the colleges
- Support ODI's work by facilitating and sharing best practices
- Support ODI & OHR recruitment & retention efforts for faculty & staff of color, including requesting data on tracking recruitment and retention numbers.
- Continue monitoring of Diversity Theme hires as it relates to diversifying the faculty.
- Promote and share diversity hiring strategies beyond the Discovery Themes

Best Practices

- The committee is interested in supporting diversity and inclusion in the graduate and professional schools, by identifying and sharing best practices across schools.
- We will continue to engage with the regional campuses, and determine how the committee can support diversity efforts, services and diversity-related concerns across our campuses.

Continuing Efforts

- Continue to monitor BART reports and receive updates
- Select the Distinguished Diversity Enhancement Award recipients
- Continue advising the Buckeye Portal for Inclusive Excellence