Memorandum

To: University Senate

From: Blaine Lilly, Chair
Council on Academic Affairs

Date: April 14, 2016

A PROPOSAL FROM THE COUNCIL ON ACADEMIC AFFAIRS TO CHANGE THE NAME OF THE DEPARTMENT OF MOLECULAR VIROLOGY, IMMUNOLOGY, AND MEDICAL GENETICS, TO THE DEPARTMENT OF CANCER BIOLOGY AND GENETICS, COLLEGE OF MEDICINE

WHEREAS the department faculty and leadership request a name change to represent the more focused research interests of the current faculty; and the proposal has the support of the Department Faculty, the College Assembly, and the Interim Dean; and

WHEREAS following expressions of concern by the Department of Molecular Genetics, College of Arts and Sciences, about the new name – potential confusion for students and possible negative impact on national visibility- the Office of Academic Affairs convened a meeting of the leadership of the two departments and Colleges in January 2015, and then of the two College Deans in May 2015; and

WHEREAS the concurrence issue could not be resolved, and thus all parties agreed that the Council on Academic Affairs should act on the proposal; and the Council has acted on other proposals where there have been disagreements over the use of names/terms; and

WHEREAS a Subcommittee of the Council reviewed the proposal and met with each department; and

WHEREAS the proposal was reviewed and approved by the full Council on Academic Affairs at its meeting on April 6, 2016, with the action presented to the Faculty Council at its meeting on April 7, 2016; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the University Senate approve the proposal from the College of Medicine to change the name of the Department of Molecular Virology, Immunology and Medical Genetics to the Department of Cancer Biology and Genetics and respectfully seek approval from the Board of Trustees.
Joanna:

The proposal from the College of Medicine to change the name of the Department of Molecular Virology, Immunology and Medical Genetics to the Department of Cancer Biology and Genetics was approved by the Council on Academic Affairs at its meeting on April 6, 2016. Thank you for attending the meeting to provide an overview of the proposal and respond to questions and comments. The Council is also grateful to Professor Mark Seeger, Chair, Department of Molecular Genetics for providing his Department’s reactions to the proposal.

During the meeting it was suggested that this Department and the Department of Molecular Genetics, working together, determine the best ways, perhaps through existing websites, to help students better distinguish among the genetics program offerings at the University, to avoid potential confusion. I will follow up with you and Mark very soon to elaborate on this suggestion.

The proposal will now be sent to the University Senate with a request for action at its meeting on April 21, 2016. The Chair of the Council, Professor Blaine Lilly will present it, but is important that you attend to respond to any questions. I will send you details as I receive them. I will also inform the Faculty Council of the Senate of this action at its meeting on April 7, 2016.

If approved by the Senate, the proposal will be sent to the Board of Trustees for action at its meeting on June 3, 2016.

Please keep a copy of this message for your file on the proposal and I will do the same for the file in the Office of Academic Affairs.

If you have any questions, please contact Professor Lilly (.2) or me.

Randy
hello anita, i hope that all is well with you and that i may make an easy request of you for a letter of support for my department. our faculty has recently voted to replace the MVIMG name with “Cancer Biology and Genetics” to represent the more focused research interests of our faculty. i am hopeful you would be willing to support this and to send back a final version of the attached letter to me and erin kimbrell out business manager. our faculty were unanimous in supporting the name change; the College Assembly in the COM was nearly so, with only one chair, director and faculty representative of the 30 or so voting no.

i appreciate your help with this. please fell free to edit this as you wish. thank you, joanna

Dear Joanna:

I've attached MG's response to your request. Unfortunately, we do not concur. I'm happy to discuss with you further although I will be leaving town for a meeting in a day or so (I will be available by email).

Sorry,
Anita
Anita K. Hopper
Dept. Molecular Genetics
Ohio State University
484 W. 12 Ave.
Riffe 800
Columbus, OH 43210
Phone: 614-688-3306
Fax: 614-247-2594

July 23, 2014

Carlo Croce M.D.
Professor and Chairman
Department of Molecular Virology, Immunology and Medical Genetics

Dear Carlo:
Regarding your request regarding the change of your department name from Molecular Virology, Immunology and Medical Genetics to Cancer Biology and Genetics, I regret to inform you that Molecular Genetics does not concur. The requested change would result in your department becoming the only unit on campus with the generic unqualified name "Genetics" without a clear addition such as: "Molecular", "Human", or "Cancer". MG is concerned that generic name “Genetics” for your department would create confusion to graduate applicants, difficulties in our developing new “genetics” courses, other administrative problems, and national visibility issues for our educational and research programs. We would hope, instead, that you would consider an alternate such as Cancer Biology and Medical Genetics or the like.
I regret disappointing you as MG desires to be collegial and we have effectively worked together in joint faculty appointments, etc., but our concern is that your proposed new
name is very broad and it will have negative impact on our teaching, graduate program, and national visibility.
Sincerely,

Anita K. Hopper
Professor and Chair
Dept. Molecular Genetics

On Jul 23, 2014, at 2:27 PM, wrote:

thanks anita. i appreciate your candor and i understand your point. the departments are so different in scope of research that there should be a path to differentiate them and remain clear with a name for both of us. let me consult with dr. croce and i will be in touch. joanna

From: Groden, Joanna
Sent: Tuesday, July 29, 2014 7:37 PM
To: Hopper, Anita <hopper.64@osu.edu>
Cc: Hadad, Christopher <hadad.1@osu.edu>; Bornstein, Robert <Robert.Bornstein@osumc.edu>; Croce, Carlo M <Carlo.Croce@osumc.edu>
Subject: Re: letter request

Anita, after some discussion with Carlo, we wondered if you might reconsider our departmental name change, given two points we may have not made clear. Our new departmental name does use Cancer to modify both Biology and Genetics. Secondly, as all our graduate teaching takes place within the umbrella program of the Biomedical Sciences Graduate Program in the College of Medicine and because we do not teach any undergraduate classes, it should not be confusing to students choosing to enroll in the classes taught by faculty in Molecular Genetics, or to joining their research laboratories. Genetics is a very broad discipline that all our faculty share. Although the emphases of research and expertise are slightly different for each department, we are hopeful that we might continue to share the title. joanna
Dear Joanna and Carlo:

I am sorry but MG does not concur with your proposed name change; this is not my decision alone as the incoming chair, other senior faculty, and our dean are all in agreement. We conclude that your proposed name change will cause confusion and could have a negative impact on our teaching mission and national visibility. Please see our specific concerns in response to your comments in red below:

...... we wondered if you might reconsider our departmental name change, given two points we may have not made clear. Our new departmental name does use Cancer to modify both Biology and Genetics. Although it may not be your intention "Cancer Biology and Genetics" does not modify Genetics as would Cancer Genetics and Biology or Medical Genetics – Genetics stands alone in the title and it will lead to the conclusion that you are the OSU Genetics department. Secondly, as all our graduate teaching takes place within the umbrella program of the Biomedical Sciences Graduate Program in the College of Medicine and because we do not teach any undergraduate classes, it should not be confusing to students choosing to enroll in the classes taught by faculty in Molecular Genetics, or to joining their research laboratories. MG teaches graduate courses to our departmental graduate program and to the IGPs. We believe that your proposed department name change will cause confusion. Genetics is a very broad discipline that all our faculty share. Although the emphases of research and expertise are slightly different for each department, we are hopeful that we might continue to share the title. We are happy to share a modified title – Molecular Genetics for us and Cancer Genetics, Medical Genetics, or another modified Genetics nomenclature for your department. We believe that we are being accommodating by concurring with a name change from MVIMG, where genetics is minimized, to a genetics focused name, such as Cancer Genetics and Biology.

I am traveling and have only limited electronic access. I will return next Thurs. In my absence, Mark Seeger is chair.

Sincerely,
Anita
From: "Seeger, Mark" <seeger.9@osu.edu>
Date: September 5, 2014 at 8:59:09 AM EDT
To: "Groden, Joanna" <groden.2@osu.edu>
Subject: Dept Name Change

Joanna -

I started my role as Chair of Molecular Genetics on Sept 1 and I'm trying to follow up on several issues that emerged during the summer months. I was curious about where MVIMG stood in terms of your departmental name change. Molecular Genetics is opposed to Cancer Biology and Genetics given that "Genetics" is unmodified. We would have no objections to either "Cancer Biology" or "Cancer Genetics and Biology". I think Anita nicely articulated our reasoning and concerns in earlier emails. In any case, I wanted to touch base and find out the status of your process.

Thanks,
Mark

Mark A Seeger, PhD
Chair, Dept of Molecular Genetics
The Ohio State University
614-292-5106

From: Groden, Joanna [Joanna.Groden@osumc.edu]
Sent: Tuesday, February 17, 2015 6:09 PM
To: Seeger, Mark
Cc: Bornstein, Robert; Croce, Carlo M; Hadad, Christopher
Subject: MVIMG Faculty Meeting 2.17.15

Hello Mark, Dr. Croce held a MVIMG faculty meeting today to discuss our name change and to discuss your department's objections to our previously unanimously selected name of "Cancer Biology and Genetics". We had 22 faculty in attendance and discussed our awkward situation; two of the four faculty who share appointments in both our departments were present. I will also forward you the list of NIH study Sections on which the faculty serve (including Molecular Genetics B) and who have scored our funded grants (including Molecular Genetics A, Cancer Genetics) once i proof-read the data if you are still interested.

We discussed your department's concerns including confusion of the names by students and those outside OSU, as well as a fear of intrusion or limitation of the undergraduate and graduate course offerings your department might propose in the future. Our faculty were concerned about the NIH benchmarking of departments in US Colleges of Medicine which invariably include Genetics as a department. There are no opportunities for anything outside of anatomy, biochemistry, cell biology, genetics, microbiology, neurosciences, pharmacology, or physiology; which leaves us without a rationale for considering molecular biology or biology as a replacement for genetics in our title.
After much debate and discussion, we held a vote: 14 of 22 faculty present at the meeting wanted to stay the course and keep our original selection of "Cancer Biology and Genetics" as a departmental name. Of those alternative names that were also considered, we had 1 vote for Department of Genetics, 3 for the Department of Cancer Biology and Genomics, 1 for Cancer Biology and Medical Genetics, 1 for the Department of Molecular Biology, 1 for the Department of Cancer Biology and Molecular Biology and zero for the Department of Cancer Genetics.

We also discussed whether your faculty would be comfortable with our faculty's universal consensus that we have no desire to prevent or compete with your department's course offerings in the future, and which we have never done previously, considering we are now the Department of Medical Genetics.

Hope we can find a balance here, Joanna

Joanna L. Groden, PhD
Vice Dean for Research
Professor and Vice Chair
College of Medicine

Office of Research
260 Meiling Hall, 370 W. 9th Avenue, Columbus, OH 43210
614-685-4685 Office / 614-292-4499 Fax
Department of Molecular Virology, Immunology and Medical Genetics
986 BRT, 460 W. 12th Avenue, Columbus, OH 43210
614-688-4301 Office / 614-688-8675 Fax
joanna.groden@osumc.edu

-----Original Message-----
From: Seeger, Mark
Sent: Friday, February 27, 2015 8:11 AM
To: Groden, Joanna <Joanna.Groden@osumc.edu>
Cc: Bornstein, Robert <Robert.Bornstein@osumc.edu>; Croce, Carlo M <Carlo.Croce@osumc.edu>; Hadad, Christopher <hadad.1@osu.edu>
Subject: RE: MVIMG Faculty Meeting 2.17.15

Joanna -

There was little change in our vote on your proposed MVIMG department name change. In this second vote on the issue: 25 voted not to concur, 2 for concurrence, and 1 abstained. The first vote last September was 24 against concurrence and 1 for concurrence.

I feel confident that MG has exhaustively considered this issue. In my opinion common ground has proven elusive not because of a lack of collegiality of either unit; instead each unit has fundamentally differing opinions about the use of an unmodified genetics in a departmental name and the potential implications of such usage.
I will pass along the MG vote and deliberations to Randy Smith and OAA. I think it is time to let the university governance process resolve our impasse.

I'm sorry to deliver this news. I would have loved for our departments to find common ground on this issue, but in the end it is clear that neither unit has moved from their original position.

Regards,
Mark

Mark A Seeger, PhD
Chair, Dept of Molecular Genetics
The Ohio State University